

**From:** [PETERSON Jenn L](mailto:PETERSON.Jenn.L)  
**To:** [Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA](mailto:Burt.Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA)  
**Cc:** [ANDERSON Jim M](mailto:ANDERSON.Jim.M); [Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA](mailto:Eric.Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA); [rgensemer@parametrix.com](mailto:rgensemer@parametrix.com)  
**Subject:** RE: First batch of draft tissue TRVs  
**Date:** 07/22/2008 10:16 AM

---

Sorry, you are right on the 0.15 mg/kg. However, the 0.09 mg/kg is what was used in the Round 2 Report for screening. I still don't know why it didn't screen in but I have my guesses. The LWG didn't look at any concentrations in carp other than 2,3,7,8-TCDD. In any case, it would be better to flesh out an appropriate baseline number in the context of this project.

-Jennifer

-----Original Message-----

From: Shephard.Burt@epamail.epa.gov  
[mailto:Shephard.Burt@epamail.epa.gov]  
Sent: Tuesday, July 22, 2008 10:07 AM  
To: PETERSON Jenn L  
Cc: ANDERSON Jim M; Blischke.Eric@epamail.epa.gov;  
rgensemer@parametrix.com  
Subject: RE: First batch of draft tissue TRVs

Jennifer,

The empirical 5th percentile we found for cadmium in Dyer et al. 2000 was 0.15 mg/kg, not 0.015 mg/kg. We're not developing a fish TRV for cadmium in the BERA because using the 0.15 mg/kg value from Dyer, all of the fish screened out. We may need a cadmium in fish number if any of the Round 3 fish exceed 0.15 mg/kg.

Best regards,

Burt Shephard  
Risk Evaluation Unit  
Office of Environmental Assessment (OEA-095)  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 10  
1200 6th Avenue  
Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 553-6359  
Fax: (206) 553-0119

e-mail: Shephard.Burt@epa.gov

"If your experiment needs statistics to analyze the results, then you ought to have done a better experiment"  
- Ernest Rutherford

"PETERSON Jenn L" <PETERSON.Jenn@ eq.state.or.us>	To Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
07/22/2008 10:00 AM	cc Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <rgensemer@parametrix.com>, "ANDERSON Jim M" <ANDERSON.Jim@eq.state.or.us>
	Subject RE: First batch of draft tissue TRVs

I looked over the TRVs for invertebrates, and didn't have any comments. The TRVs seem reasonable with what is in the literature. I did, however, have some comments related to developing the TRVs for invertebrates only, especially for cadmium.

Cadmium: Carp had the highest cadmium concentration at 0.108 ppm (peamouth 0.053, sculpin 0.022, largescale sucker 0.0325, chinook 0.027, smallmouth bass 0.024, northern pikeminnow 0.012). The TRV used in the Round 2 report by the LWG (5th percentile LOAEL) was 0.09 ppm. The LWG number may be a bit high for screening, given the TSC presented in the Dyer publication is 0.042 mg/kg (Shephard TSC), and 0.015 mg/kg (5th percentile literature number) for fish. Several fish exceed these values, but regardless, since carp exceed the number used in the Round 2 Report why aren't we developing a TRV for fish?

-Jennifer

-----Original Message-----

From: Blischke.Eric@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Blischke.Eric@epamail.epa.gov]  
Sent: Monday, July 21, 2008 2:26 PM  
To: Shephard.Burt@epamail.epa.gov; Humphrey.Chip@epamail.epa.gov; Davoli.Dana@epamail.epa.gov; GAINER Tom; Grepo-Grove.Gina@epamail.epa.gov; PETERSON Jenn L; jeremy\_buck@fws.gov; ANDERSON Jim M; Goulet.Joe@epamail.epa.gov; Smith.Judy@epamail.epa.gov; Koch.Kristine@epamail.epa.gov; MCCLINCY Matt; POULSEN Mike; Fuentes.Rene@epamail.epa.gov; Robert.Neely@noaa.gov; Sheldrake.Sea@epamail.epa.gov; tomd@ctsi.nsn.us; csmith@parametrix.com; rgensemer@parametrix.com; rose@yakama.com; erin.madden@gmail.com; jay.field@noaa.gov; Cora.Lori@epamail.epa.gov; Ader.Mark@epamail.epa.gov; BBarquin@hk-law.com; audiehuber@ctuir.com; Lisa.BlueLake@grandronde.org; sheila@ridolfi.com; Benjamin Shorr; LavelleJM@cdm.com; Mary.Baker@noaa.gov; Michael.Karnosh@grandronde.org; FARRER David G; dallen@stratus jpeers@stratusconsulting.com; (b) (6) Bob Dexter; cunningham@gorge.net; JMalek@parametrix.com; nancy.munn@noaa.gov; Greg.Gervais@noaa.gov

Cc: lbernardini@parametrix.com  
Subject: Fw: First batch of draft tissue TRVs

As promised, here are the first set of TRVs. As I indicated on the schedule I sent out last week, internal government team members will be given one week to review these TRVs and an additional week to discuss and finalize for delivery to the LWG.

Please provide comments on this set of TRVs (Sb, Cd and As) by COB, July 28, 2008. If you have any questions, please contact me.

Thanks, Eric

----- Forwarded by Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US on 07/21/2008 02:22 PM -----

"Robert W.  
Gensemer"  
<rgensemer@param  
etrix.com>

07/21/2008 01:37  
PM

To  
Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA,  
Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA  
cc  
David DeForest  
<deforest@parametrix.com>,  
"Carrie A. Smith"  
<CSmith@parametrix.com>, Brad  
Hermanson  
<BHermanson@parametrix.com>  
Subject  
First batch of draft tissue TRVs

Eric and Burt: Attached is our first batch of tissue TRVs for antimony, arsenic, and cadmium that are ready to go for internal government team review. Will you be forwarding to the government team, or would you like us to do that? Let me know if the latter, but I assumed one of you would probably prefer to do the distribution, and your lists are probably more accurate than mine would be anyway.

For this batch, note that even though we have files attached here for antimony, we are actually recommending to not use this single study as the basis of a TRV for the BERA. Its just not reliable enough in our opinion for this purpose; see the attached word file for a description of why.

Call with any questions.  
-Bob

Parametrix  
inspired people - inspired solutions - making a difference

Robert W. Gensemer, Ph.D.  
Senior Toxicologist, Operations Manager

phone: 541.791.1667, x-6510

fax: 541.791.1699

cell: 541.760.1511

rgensemer@parametrix.com

(See attached file: Antimony Draft Tissue TRV (21 July 2008).doc)(See

attached file: Cadmium Draft Tissue TRV Data (21 July 2008).xls)(See

attached file: Arsenic Draft Tissue TRV Data (21 July 2008).xls)(See

attached file: Cadmium Draft Tissue TRV (21 July 2008).xls.doc)(See

attached file: Arsenic Draft Tissue TRV (21 July 2008).doc)(See attached

file: Antimony Draft Tissue TRV Data (21 July 2008).xls)